# BEFORE THE CALIFORNIA PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION THE CALIFORNIA ENERGY COMMISSION 12-03-07 04:59 PM

Order Instituting Rulemaking to Implement the Commission's Procurement Incentive Framework and to Examine the Integration of Greenhouse Gas Emissions Standards into Procurement Policies Rulemaking 06-04-009 (Filed April 13, 2006)

CEC No. 07-OIIP-01

# COMMENTS OF POWEREX CORP. ON TYPE AND POINT OF REGULATION ISSUES

GOODIN, MACBRIDE, SQUERI, DAY & LAMPREY, LLP James D. Squeri 505 Sansome Street, Suite 900 San Francisco, CA 94111 Telephone: (415) 392-7900 Facsimile: (415) 398-4321

E-mail:jsqueri@goodinmacbride.com Attorneys for POWEREX CORP.

Dated: December 3, 2007

## BEFORE THE CALIFORNIA PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION AND THE CALIFORNIA ENERGY COMMISSION

Order Instituting Rulemaking to Implement the Commission's Procurement Incentive Framework and to Examine the Integration of Greenhouse Gas Emissions Standards into Procurement Policies Rulemaking 06-04-009 (Filed April 13, 2006)

CEC No. 07-OIIP-01

# COMMENTS OF POWEREX CORP ON TYPE AND POINT OF REGULATION ISSUES

In accordance with the "Administrative Law Judges' Ruling Requesting

Comments on Type and Point of Regulation Issues" dated November 9, 2007, Powerex Corp.

("Powerex") hereby submits its comments. 1

Powerex is the marketing subsidiary of British Columbia Hydro and Power Authority ("BC Hydro"). Powerex sells power at wholesale in the United States pursuant to market-based rate authority granted by the Federal Energy Regulatory Commission, including supply from competitively-priced qualifying renewable (small hydro, biomass and landfill gas) generation facilities.

#### I. INTRODUCTION

Powerex supports the first-seller approach to regulation of GHG emissions for a number of reasons. Perhaps most significantly, such an approach is suitable as a model for a national or regional program and, if adopted by California, can be easily integrated with broader regional or national programs. A first-seller approach can be readily scaled to include additional jurisdictions. For example, in conjunction with implementation of the Western Climate Initiative

<sup>1</sup> By e-mail dated November 19, 2007, the presiding ALJ extended the due date for the filing of initial comments from November 28, 2007 to December 3, 2007.

- 1 -

(WCI), a first-seller approach would reduce the risks of contract shuffling and would be more likely to place emitters in the appropriate dispatch order. It would have the further benefit of ensuring that imports to California (from outside California or even from outside the WCI) are afforded the same opportunity and equal treatment as that available to emitters within California (or the WCI).

A cap and trade system of regulation under which the first seller is the point of regulation offers scalability; broadens the market for GHG compliance units/allowances; and incorporates GHG compliance costs within electricity costs, thereby providing the correct price signal to the market to place generation in the appropriate dispatch order. Powerex therefore supports such a system of GHG regulation for the electricity sector as a fair and logical basis for meeting the mandates of AB 32.

#### II. <u>COMMENTS</u>

Powerex's comments follow the outline of pertinent issues and questions as set forth in the ALJ Ruling dated November 9, 2007. While the subject comments only respond to a limited subset of the questions asked in the ALJ Ruling, Powerex remains interested in the full range of issues identified in the ALJ Ruling and reserves its right to reply to matters that are not necessarily addressed in these comments.

#### 3.1. General:

Q1. What do you view as the incremental benefits of a market-based system for GHG compliance, in the current California context?

A properly designed market-based system for GHG compliance in the electrical sector can, if designed properly, accomplish a number of desirable goals, including (i) reliance on market-based efficiencies to lower the cost of compliance; (ii) establishment of appropriate price signals for lower and zero emission resources; and (iii) placement of higher emitting

resources appropriately within California's preferred dispatch order by reflecting the cost of electricity and carbon pricing together, rather than the cost of electricity alone, in the dispatch order.

Q2. Can a market-based system provide additional emissions reductions beyond existing policies and/or programs?

Assuming a cap and trade system, it is the cap that sets the limit of emissions. The efficiencies/costs associated with compliance, from one emitter to another, would set the relative price level of compliance with the cap. A market-based system rewards efficiencies through a market for allowances; the existence of such a marketplace does not in and of itself reduce emissions below the cap. Rather, it allows those that do reduce below the cap to sell their "excess" allowances in a marketplace, thus ensuring efficient compliance with the cap by those emitters that otherwise could not reduce their emissions at a cost below the market clearing price of allowances.

#### 3.2. Principles or Objectives to be Considered in Evaluating Design Options

• Goal attainment: Does the approach being considered have any particular advantages in terms of meeting overall emission reduction goals?

Yes, a load-based cap and trade system, for example, may not immediately reduce emissions outside of California as other regions may simply continue to buy the GHG-intensive energy that California spurned (the concept of contract shuffling). Furthermore, a load-based system does not send the correct price signal to the marketplace to place generation in the appropriate dispatch order when electricity and GHG compliance costs are considered together. A first-seller approach would place ghg-intensive generation higher in the dispatch order thus eventually favoring the dispatch of lower emission generators.

• Cost minimization: Is the approach likely to minimize the total cost to end users of achieving a given GHG reduction target?

Absolutely. A cap and trade model, especially in a regional context, would broaden the market for GHG compliance units/allowances and promote a lower cost of compliance than would a model focused primarily on emissions from California-based load. alone.

• Environmental Integrity: Does the approach mitigate or allow contract shuffling and the leakage of emissions occurring outside of California as a result of efforts to reduce emissions in California?

Both first-seller and a load-based models have similar environmental integrity problems in the "California only" context. In a broader regional context, under the first-seller model, the majority of generators will have emissions directly attributed and will make optimal economic decisions that support real reductions. By contrast, under a model that relies heavily on broad regional factors (i.e. load-based models and a "California only" first-seller approach), there is a much higher risk of leakage and contract shuffling.

• Expandability: Would the approach integrate easily into a broader regional or national program? A related consideration is the suitability of the approach as a model for a national or regional program.

Yes, a first-seller approach is easily scaled to include additional jurisdictions. For example, under implementation of the WCI, a first-seller approach dramatically reduces the risk of contract shuffling and places emitters in the appropriate dispatch order. It has the added benefit of ensuring that imports to California from outside California, or the WCI for that matter, are treated equally to those emitters within California (or the WCI).

• Accuracy: Does the approach support accuracy in reporting and, therefore, ensure that reported emission reductions are real?

Load-based cap and trade is substantially weaker than first seller in terms of an approach that supports accuracy in reporting, particularly in the broader context of the WCI. Under a load-based model, imports are assessed a broadly estimated regional intensity factor. These broad regional factors decrease accuracy and decrease the likelihood of real reductions. Under the first-seller approach, generators are monitored at source and will factor actual emissions directly into their dispatch decisions while imports would be given broadly estimated regional intensity factors. Viewed in isolation, a first-seller model for California still has a large role for estimated regional intensity factors, albeit in the context of a broader regional initiative; the portion of imports to the region in which regional intensity factors are needed will drop dramatically.

#### 3.3. Load-Based Cap-and-Trade System Design

Q6. Which of these systems best accounts for all imports? What are the advantages and disadvantages of each potential tracking system in terms of accuracy, cost of development and administration of tracking systems, costs of administration to the parties, and overall costs to ratepayers? Are there alternative tracking approaches that you would recommend, and for what reasons?

Powerex is not supportive of any of the forms of a load-based system, all of which suffer the disadvantages and inefficiencies necessarily associated with the tracking mechanisms that would be required under a load-based system.

#### 3.4. Source-based Cap-and-trade System Design Options

#### 3.4.1. Pure Source-based (GHG Regulation of In-state Generation Only)

Under an in-state-only source-based approach, the regulated entities would be the power plants located in California that generate electricity and emit GHGs. Under such a system, electricity use associated with imports would not be directly regulated under the cap-and-trade system. Instead, other policies and programs such as energy efficiency and the Renewable Portfolio Standard (RPS) would be utilized to decrease reliance on imported GHG-intensive power sources

Q15. Please comment on the "First Seller Design Description" paper, which is Attachment A to this ruling. Does the paper accurately describe the deliverer/first seller program? If not, describe your concerns and include an accurate description from your perspective.

Yes, the paper accurately describes the deliver/first seller program. However much of the complexity in tracking and management of the first seller model as suggested in the paper would drop dramatically within the context of the WCI.

Q19. If retail providers are responsible for internalizing the cost of carbon for imported power, all power generated in-state may need to be tracked to load to avoid double regulation of in-state power. Do you agree?

Yes

#### 3.5. Deferral of a Market-based Cap-and-Trade System

Q21. How important is it that a cap-and-trade system be included in the near-term as part of the electricity sector's AB 32 compliance strategy?

The "cap" in cap and trade sets the level of reduction and the market then sets the cost of compliance. If one assumes emitting generators will seek the lowest cost of compliance, then market forces ought to wring out efficiencies of compliance. A cap alone unfairly assumes all emitters have the same cost of compliance, penalizes those that have a higher cost of compliance, and does not reward those that may be able to reduce emissions greater than what is required by compliance through being rewarded by the market for such action. All of the alternatives that would defer implementation of a market-based system would have the effect of reducing emissions but would not unleash market efficiencies for complying with such mechanism. The relative negative impacts of not allowing markets to assist in the implementation of AB32 would almost certainly increase the cost of compliance.

Q23. Address how deferral of a cap-and-trade program for the electricity sector would facilitate or hinder California's integration into a subsequent regional or federal program.

Powerex does not offer an opinion on how emission reduction obligations could work in the absence of cap and trade or how increased programmatic goals would increase rates. Powerex's view is that a market-based system with as broad (i.e. WCI) a geographic area as possible will likely produce the lowest cost of compliance under a first-seller cap and trade model. Powerex supports any efforts California might take to work within the WCI to solve many of the Greenhouse Gas tracking problems that may appear substantial when viewed in isolation.

Q29. Address and compare how each of the alternatives identified in the above questions, and the proposal you submit in response to the preceding question, would perform relative to each of the principles or objectives listed above and any other principles or objectives you propose.

As discussed throughout Powerex's comments in this filing, Powerex strongly supports a first-seller cap and trade model to encourage market efficiencies of compliance, to allow for scalability for a regional or national GHG compliance model, to eliminate the risk of contract shuffling, and to ensure proper dispatch order for generators.

#### III. CONCLUSION

Powerex recommends that a market-based system with first sellers as the point of regulation serve as the basis of the joint Commission-CEC recommendation to the California Air Resources Boards regarding the type and point of regulation of GHG emissions that should be adopted by California with respect to the electricity sector.

#### Respectfully submitted this 3rd day of December, 2007 at San Francisco,

California.

GOODIN, MACBRIDE, SQUERI, DAY & LAMPREY, LLP James D. Squeri 505 Sansome Street, Suite 900 San Francisco, California 94111 Telephone: (415) 392-7900

Facsimile: (415) 398-4321

E-mail: jsqueri@goodinmacbride.com

By <u>/s/ James D. Squeri</u> James D. Squeri

Attorneys for POWEREX CORP.

2879/001/X94787.v1

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I, Lisa Vieland, certify that I have on this 3rd day of December 2007 caused a copy of the foregoing

### COMMENTS OF POWEREX CORP. ON TYPE AND POINT OF REGULATION ISSUES

to be served on all known parties to R.06-04-009 listed on the most recently updated service list available on the California Public Utilities Commission website, via email to those listed with email and via U.S. mail to those without email service. I also caused courtesy copies to be hand-delivered as follows:

Commissioner, President Michael R. Peevey California Public Utilities Commission State Building, Room 5218 505 Van Ness Avenue San Francisco, CA 94102 ALJ Charlotte TerKeurst California Public Utilities Commission State Building, Room 5117 505 Van Ness Avenue San Francisco, CA 94102

ALJ Jonathan Lakritz California Public Utilities Commission State Building, Room 5020 505 Van Ness Avenue San Francisco, CA 94102

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct. Executed this 3rd day of December 2007 at San Francisco, California.

/s/ Lisa Vieland
Lisa Vieland

#### Service List R.06-04-009 Last Updated 11/30/07

CINDY ADAMS cadams@covantaenergy.com

STEVEN S. SCHLEIMER steven.schleimer@barclayscapital.com

STEVEN HUHMAN steven.huhman@morganstanley.com

RICK C. NOGER rick\_noger@praxair.com

KEITH R. MCCREA keith.mccrea@sablaw.com

ADAM J. KATZ ajkatz@mwe.com

CATHERINE M. KRUPKA ckrupka@mwe.com

KYLE D. BOUDREAUX kyle\_boudreaux@fpl.com

CATHY S. WOOLLUMS cswoollums@midamerican.com

CYNTHIA A. FONNER Cynthia.A.Fonner@constellation.com

KEVIN BOUDREAUX kevin.boudreaux@calpine.com

THOMAS DILL trdill@westernhubs.com

E.J. WRIGHT ej\_wright@oxy.com

PAUL M. SEBY pseby@mckennalong.com

TIMOTHY R. ODIL todil@mckennalong.com

STEPHEN G. KOERNER, ESQ. steve.koerner@elpaso.com

JENINE SCHENK jenine.schenk@apses.com

JOHN B. WELDON, JR. jbw@slwplc.com

KELLY BARR kelly.barr@srpnet.com

ROBERT R. TAYLOR rrtaylor@srpnet.com

STEVEN S. MICHEL smichel@westernresources.org

ROGER C. MONTGOMERY roger.montgomery@swgas.com

LORRAINE PASKETT Lorraine.Paskett@ladwp.com RONALD F. DEATON ron.deaton@ladwp.com

SID NEWSOM snewsom@semprautilities.com

DAVID L. HUARD dhuard@manatt.com

CURTIS L. KEBLER curtis.kebler@gs.com

DENNIS M.P. EHLING dehling@klng.com

GREGORY KOISER gregory.koiser@constellation.com

NORMAN A. PEDERSEN npedersen@hanmor.com

MICHAEL MAZUR mmazur@3phasesRenewables.com

VITALY LEE vitaly.lee@aes.com

TIFFANY RAU tiffany.rau@bp.com

GREGORY KLATT klatt@energyattorney.com

RICHARD HELGESON rhelgeson@scppa.org

DANIEL W. DOUGLASS douglass@energyattorney.com

PAUL DELANEY pssed@adelphia.net

BARRY R. WALLERSTEIN bwallerstein@agmd.gov

AKBAR JAZAYEIRI akbar.jazayeri@sce.com

ANNETTE GILLIAM annette.gilliam@sce.com

CATHY A. KARLSTAD cathy.karlstad@sce.com

LAURA I. GENAO Laura.Genao@sce.com

RONALD MOORE rkmoore@gswater.com

DON WOOD dwood8@cox.net

AIMEE M. SMITH amsmith@sempra.com

ALLEN K. TRIAL atrial@sempra.com

ALVIN PAK apak@sempraglobal.com

DAN HECHT dhecht@sempratrading.com

DANIEL A. KING daking@sempra.com

SYMONE VONGDEUANE svongdeuane@semprasolutions.com

THEODORE ROBERTS troberts@sempra.com

DONALD C. LIDDELL, P.C. liddell@energyattorney.com

MARCIE MILNER marcie.milner@shell.com

REID A. WINTHROP rwinthrop@pilotpowergroup.com

THOMAS DARTON tdarton@pilotpowergroup.com

STEVE RAHON lschavrien@semprautilities.com

GLORIA BRITTON GloriaB@anzaelectric.org

LYNELLE LUND llund@commerceenergy.com

TAMLYN M. HUNT thunt@cecmail.org

JEANNE M. SOLE jeanne.sole@sfgov.org

JOHN P. HUGHES john.hughes@sce.com

LAD LORENZ llorenz@semprautilities.com

MARCEL HAWIGER marcel@turn.org

NINA SUETAKE nsuetake@turn.org

Diana L. Lee dil@cpuc.ca.gov

F. Jackson Stoddard fjs@cpuc.ca.gov

AUDREY CHANG achang@nrdc.org

DONALD BROOKHYSER rsa@a-klaw.com

EVELYN KAHL ek@a-klaw.com

KRISTIN GRENFELL kgrenfell@nrdc.org

MICHAEL P. ALCANTAR mpa@a-klaw.com

SEEMA SRINIVASAN sls@a-klaw.com

WILLIAM H. CHEN bill.chen@constellation.com

BRIAN K. CHERRY bkc7@pge.com

EDWARD G POOLE epoole@adplaw.com

ANN G. GRIMALDI agrimaldi@mckennalong.com

BRIAN T. CRAGG bcragg@goodinmacbride.com

JAMES D. SQUERI jsqueri@gmssr.com

JEANNE B. ARMSTRONG jarmstrong@goodinmacbride.com

KAREN BOWEN kbowen@winston.com

LISA A. COTTLE lcottle@winston.com

SEAN P. BEATTY sbeatty@cwclaw.com

VIDHYA PRABHAKARAN vprabhakaran@goodinmacbride.com

JOSEPH M. KARP jkarp@winston.com

JEFFREY P. GRAY jeffgray@dwt.com

CHRISTOPHER J. WARNER cjw5@pge.com

SARA STECK MYERS ssmyers@att.net

LARS KVALE lars@resource-solutions.org

ANDREW L. HARRIS alho@pge.com

ANDREA WELLER aweller@sel.com

JENNIFER CHAMBERLIN jchamberlin@strategicenergy.com

BETH VAUGHAN beth@beth411.com

KERRY HATTEVIK kerry.hattevik@mirant.com

AVIS KOWALEWSKI kowalewskia@calpine.com

WILLIAM H. BOOTH wbooth@booth-law.com

J. ANDREW HOERNER hoerner@redefiningprogress.org

JANILL RICHARDS janill.richards@doj.ca.gov

CLIFF CHEN cchen@ucsusa.org

GREGG MORRIS gmorris@emf.net

R. THOMAS BEACH tomb@crossborderenergy.com

KENNETH C. JOHNSON kijnnovation@earthlink.net

BARRY F. MCCARTHY bmcc@mccarthylaw.com

C. SUSIE BERLIN sberlin@mccarthylaw.com

MIKE LAMOND Mike@alpinenaturalgas.com

JOY A. WARREN joyw@mid.org

UDI HELMAN UHelman@caiso.com

JOHN JENSEN jjensen@kirkwood.com

MARY LYNCH mary.lynch@constellation.com

LEONARD DEVANNA Irdevanna-rf@cleanenergysystems.com

ANDREW BROWN abb@eslawfirm.com

BRUCE MCLAUGHLIN mclaughlin@braunlegal.com

GREGGORY L. WHEATLAND glw@eslawfirm.com

JANE E. LUCKHARDT jluckhardt@downeybrand.com

JEFFERY D. HARRIS jdh@eslawfirm.com

VIRGIL WELCH vwelch@environmentaldefense.org

WILLIAM W. WESTERFIELD, 111 www@eslawfirm.com

DOWNEY BRAND DOWNEY BRAND Sacramento Municipal 555 CAPITOL MALL, 10TH FLOOR SACRAMENTO, CA 95814-4686

RAYMOND J. CZAHAR, C.P.A. westgas@aol.com

STEVEN M. COHN scohn@smud.org

ANN L. TROWBRIDGE atrowbridge@daycartermurphy.com

DAN SILVERIA dansvec@hdo.net

JESSICA NELSON notice@psrec.coop

DONALD BROOKHYSER deb@a-klaw.com

CYNTHIA SCHULTZ cynthia.schultz@pacificorp.com

KYLE L. DAVIS kyle.l.davis@pacificorp.com

RYAN FLYNN ryan.flynn@pacificorp.com

IAN CARTER carter@ieta.org

JASON DUBCHAK jason.dubchak@niskags.com

BRIAN M. JONES bjones@mjbradley.com

MATTHEW MOST EDISON MISSION MARKETING & TRADING, INC. 160 FEDERAL STREET BOSTON, MA 02110-1776

KENNETH A. COLBURN kcolburn@symbioticstrategies.com

RICHARD COWART rapcowart@aol.com

KATHRYN WIG Kathryn.Wig@nrgenergy.com

SAKIS ASTERIADIS sasteriadis@apx.com

GEORGE HOPLEY george.hopley@barcap.com

ELIZABETH ZELLJADT ez@pointcarbon.com

DALLAS BURTRAW burtraw@rff.org

VERONIQUE BUGNION vb@pointcarbon.com

ANDREW BRADFORD andrew.bradford@constellation.com

GARY BARCH gbarch@knowledgeinenergy.com

RALPH E. DENNIS ralph.dennis@constellation.com

SAMARA MINDEL smindel@knowledgeinenergy.com

BARRY RABE brabe@umich.edu

BRIAN POTTS bpotts@foley.com

JAMES W. KEATING james.keating@bp.com

JAMES ROSS jimross@r-c-s-inc.com

TRENT A. CARLSON tcarlson@reliant.com

GARY HINNERS ghinners@reliant.com

JEANNE ZAIONTZ zaiontj@bp.com

JULIE L. MARTIN julie.martin@bp.com

FIJI GEORGE fiji.george@elpaso.com

ED CHIANG echiang@elementmarkets.com

FRANK STERN fstern@summitblue.com

NADAV ENBAR nenbar@energy-insights.com

NICHOLAS LENSSEN nlenssen@energy-insights.com

ELIZABETH BAKER bbaker@summitblue.com

WAYNE TOMLINSON william.tomlinson@elpaso.com

KEVIN J. SIMONSEN kjsimonsen@ems-ca.com

SANDRA ELY Sandra.ely@state.nm.us BRIAN MCQUOWN bmcquown@reliant.com

DOUGLAS BROOKS dbrooks@nevp.com

ANITA HART anita.hart@swgas.com

RANDY SABLE randy.sable@swgas.com

BILL SCHRAND bill.schrand@swgas.com

JJ PRUCNAL jj.prucnal@swgas.com

SANDRA CAROLINA sandra.carolina@swgas.com

CYNTHIA MITCHELL ckmitchell1@sbcglobal.net

CHRISTOPHER A. HILEN chilen@sppc.com

ELENA MELLO emello@sppc.com

TREVOR DILLARD tdillard@sierrapacific.com

DARRELL SOYARS dsoyars@sppc.com

JOSEPH GRECO jgreco@caithnessenergy.com

LEILANI JOHNSON KOWAL leilani.johnson@ladwp.com

RANDY S. HOWARD randy.howard@ladwp.com

ROBERT K. ROZANSKI Robert.Rozanski@ladwp.com

ROBERT L. PETTINATO robert.pettinato@ladwp.com

HUGH YAO

HYao@SempraUtilities.com

RASHA PRINCE rprince@semprautilities.com

RANDALL W. KEEN rkeen@manatt.com

S. NANCY WHANG nwhang@manatt.com

PETER JAZAYERI pjazayeri@stroock.com

DEREK MARKOLF derek@climateregistry.org

DAVID NEMTZOW david@nemtzow.com

HARVEY EDER

harveyederpspc.org@hotmail.com

STEVE ENDO

sendo@ci.pasadena.ca.us

STEVEN G. LINS slins@ci.glendale.ca.us

TOM HAMILTON
THAMILTON5@CHARTER.NET

BRUNO JEIDER bjeider@ci.burbank.ca.us

RICHARD J. MORILLO rmorillo@ci.burbank.ca.us

ROGER PELOTE roger.pelote@williams.com

AIMEE BARNES aimee.barnes@ecosecurities.com

CASE ADMINISTRATION case.admin@sce.com

TIM HEMIG tim.hemig@nrgenergy.com

BARRY LOVELL bjl@bry.com

ALDYN HOEKSTRA aldyn.hoekstra@paceglobal.com

YVONNE GROSS ygross@sempraglobal.com

JOHN LAUN jlaun@apogee.net

KIM KIENER kmkiener@fox.net

SCOTT J. ANDERS scottanders@sandiego.edu

JOSEPH R. KLOBERDANZ jkloberdanz@semprautilities.com

ANDREW MCALLISTER andrew.mcallister@energycenter.org

JACK BURKE jack.burke@energycenter.org

JENNIFER PORTER jennifer.porter@energycenter.org

SEPHRA A. NINOW sephra.ninow@energycenter.org

DESPINA NIEHAUS dniehaus@semprautilities.com

JOHN W. LESLIE jleslie@luce.com

ORLANDO B. FOOTE, III ofoote@hkcf-law.com

ELSTON K. GRUBAUGH ekgrubaugh@iid.com

THOMAS MCCABE EDISON MISSION ENERGY 18101 VON KARMAN AVE., SUITE 1700 IRVINE. CA 92612

JAN PEPPER pepper@cleanpowermarkets.com

GLORIA D. SMITH gsmith@adamsbroadwell.com

MARC D. JOSEPH mdjoseph@adamsbroadwell.com

DIANE I. FELLMAN diane fellman@fpl.com

HAYLEY GOODSON hayley@turn.org

MICHEL FLORIO mflorio@turn.org

DAN ADLER
Dan.adler@calcef.org

MICHAEL A. HYAMS mhyams@sfwater.org

THERESA BURKE tburke@sfwater.org

NORMAN J. FURUTA norman.furuta@navy.mil

AMBER MAHONE amber@ethree.com

ANNABELLE MALINS annabelle.malins@fco.gov.uk

DEVRA WANG dwang@nrdc.org

KAREN TERRANOVA filings@a-klaw.com

NORA SHERIFF nes@a-klaw.com

OLOF BYSTROM obystrom@cera.com

SETH HILTON sdhilton@stoel.com

SHERYL CARTER scarter@nrdc.org

ASHLEE M. BONDS abonds@thelen.com

CARMEN E. BASKETTE cbaskette@enernoc.com

COLIN PETHERAM colin.petheram@att.com

JAMES W. TARNAGHAN jwmctarnaghan@duanemorris.com

KEVIN FOX kfox@wsgr.com

KHURSHID KHOJA kkhoja@thelenreid.com

PETER V. ALLEN pvallen@thelen.com

SHERIDAN J. PAUKER spauker@wsgr.com

ROBERT J. REINHARD rreinhard@mofo.com

CALIFORNIA ENERGY MARKETS cem@newsdata.com

HOWARD V. GOLUB hgolub@nixonpeabody.com

JANINE L. SCANCARELLI jscancarelli@flk.com

JOSEPH F. WIEDMAN jwiedman@goodinmacbride.com

MARTIN A. MATTES mmattes@nossaman.com

JEN MCGRAW jen@cnt.org

LISA WEINZIMER lisa weinzimer@platts.com

STEVEN MOSS steven@moss.net

SHAUN ELLIS sellis@fypower.org

ARNO HARRIS arno@recurrentenergy.com

BIANCA BOWMAN BRBc@pge.com

ED LUCHA ELL5@pge.com

GRACE LIVINGSTON-NUNLEY gxl2@pge.com

JASMIN ANSAR jxa2@pge.com JONATHAN FORRESTER JDF1@PGE.COM

RAYMOND HUNG RHHJ@pge.com

SEBASTIEN CSAPO sscb@pge.com

SOUMYA SASTRY svs6@pge.com

STEPHANIE LA SHAWN S1L7@pge.com

VALERIE J. WINN vjw3@pge.com

KARLA DAILEY karla.dailey@cityofpaloalto.org

FARROKH ALBUYEH farrokh.albuyeh@oati.net

DEAN R. TIBBS dtibbs@aes4u.com

JEFFREY L. HAHN jhahn@covantaenergy.com

ANDREW J. VAN HORN andy.vanhorn@vhcenergy.com

JOSEPH M. PAUL Joe.paul@dynegy.com

SUE KATELEY info@calseia.org

GREG BLUE gblue@enxco.com

SARAH BESERRA sbeserra@sbcglobal.net

MONICA A. SCHWEBS, ESQ. monica.schwebs@bingham.com

PETER W. HANSCHEN phanschen@mofo.com

JOSEPH HENRI josephhenri@hotmail.com

PATRICIA THOMPSON pthompson@summitblue.com

WILLIAM F. DIETRICH dietrichlaw2@earthlink.net

BETTY SETO Betty.Seto@kema.com

GERALD L. LAHR JerryL@abag.ca.gov

JODY S. LONDON jody\_london\_consulting@earthlink.net

STEVEN SCHILLER steve@schiller.com

MRW & ASSOCIATES, INC. mrw@mrwassoc.com

REED V. SCHMIDT rschmidt@bartlewells.com

ADAM BRIONES adamb@greenlining.org

STEVE KROMER stevek@kromer.com

CLYDE MURLEY clyde.murley@comcast.net

BRENDA LEMAY brenda.lemay@horizonwind.com

CARLA PETERMAN carla.peterman@gmail.com

EDWARD VINE elvine@lbl.gov

RYAN WISER rhwiser@lbl.gov

CHRIS MARNAY
C Marnay@lbl.gov

PHILLIP J. MULLER philm@scdenergy.com

RITA NORTON rita@ritanortonconsulting.com

CARL PECHMAN cpechman@powereconomics.com

MAHLON ALDRIDGE emahlon@ecoact.org

RICHARD SMITH richards@mid.org

ROGER VAN HOY rogerv@mid.org

THOMAS S. KIMBALL tomk@mid.org

WES MONIER fwmonier@tid.org

BARBARA R. BARKOVICH brbarkovich@earthlink.net

JOHN R. REDDING johnrredding@earthlink.net

CLARK BERNIER clark.bernier@rlw.com

RICHARD MCCANN, PH.D rmccann@umich.edu

CAROLYN M. KEHREIN cmkehrein@ems-ca.com

CALIFORNIA ISO e-recipient@caiso.com

GRANT ROSENBLUM, ESQ. grosenblum@caiso.com

KAREN EDSON 151 BLUE RAVINE ROAD FOLSOM, CA 95630

ROBIN SMUTNY-JONES rsmutny-jones@caiso.com

SAEED FARROKHPAY saeed.farrokhpay@ferc.gov

DAVID BRANCHCOMB david@branchcomb.com

KENNY SWAIN kenneth.swain@navigantconsulting.com

KIRBY DUSEL kdusel@navigantconsulting.com

GORDON PICKERING gpickering@navigantconsulting.com

LAURIE PARK lpark@navigantconsulting.com

DAVID REYNOLDS davidreynolds@ncpa.com

SCOTT TOMASHEFSKY scott.tomashefsky@ncpa.com

ELLEN WOLFE ewolfe@resero.com

AUDRA HARTMANN Audra.Hartmann@Dynegy.com

BOB LUCAS
Bob.lucas@calobby.com

CURT BARRY curt.barry@iwpnews.com

DAN SKOPEC danskopec@gmail.com

DANIELLE MATTHEWS SEPERAS dseperas@calpine.com

DAVID L. MODISETTE dave@ppallc.com

DOUGLAS K. KERNER dkk@eslawfirm.com

JUSTIN C. WYNNE wynne@braunlegal.com

KASSANDRA GOUGH kgough@calpine.com

KELLIE SMITH kellie.smith@sen.ca.gov

KEVIN WOODRUFF kdw@woodruff-expert-services.com

MICHAEL WAUGH mwaugh@arb.ca.gov

PANAMA BARTHOLOMY pbarthol@energy.state.ca.us

PATRICK STONER pstoner@lgc.org

RACHEL MCMAHON rachel@ceert.org

RYAN BERNARDO bernardo@braunlegal.com

STEVEN A. LIPMAN steven@lipmanconsulting.com

STEVEN KELLY steven@iepa.com

WEBSTER TASAT wtasat@arb.ca.gov

EDWARD J. TIEDEMANN etiedemann@kmtg.com

LAURIE TEN HOPE Itenhope@energy.state.ca.us

JOSHUA BUSHINSKY bushinskyj@pewclimate.org

LYNN HAUG Imh@eslawfirm.com

OBADIAH BARTHOLOMY obartho@smud.org

BUD BEEBE bbeebe@smud.org

BALWANT S. PUREWAL bpurewal@water.ca.gov

DOUGLAS MACMULLLEN dmacmull@water.ca.gov

KAREN NORENE MILLS kmills@cfbf.com

KAREN LINDH karen@klindh.com

ELIZABETH W. HADLEY ehadley@reupower.com

ANNE-MARIE MADISON
Anne-Marie Madison@TransAlta.com

ANNIE STANGE sas@a-klaw.com

ELIZABETH WESTBY egw@a-klaw.com

ALEXIA C. KELLY akelly@climatetrust.org

ALAN COMNES alan.comnes@nrgenergy.com

KYLE SILON kyle.silon@ecosecurities.com

CATHIE ALLEN californiadockets@pacificorp.com

PHIL CARVER Philip.H.Carver@state.or.us

SAM SADLER samuel.r.sadler@state.or.us

LISA SCHWARTZ lisa.c.schwartz@state.or.us

CLARE BREIDENICH cbreidenich@yahoo.com

DONALD SCHOENBECK dws@r-c-s-inc.com

JESUS ARREDONDO jesus.arredondo@nrgenergy.com

CHARLIE BLAIR charlie.blair@delta-ee.com

THOMAS ELGIE Tom.Elgie@powerex.com

CLARENCE BINNINGER clarence.binninger@doj.ca.gov

DAVID ZONANA david.zonana@doj.ca.gov

Andrew Campbell agc@cpuc.ca.gov

Anne Gillette aeg@cpuc.ca.gov

Beth Moore blm@cpuc.ca.gov

Cathleen A. Fogel cf1@cpuc.ca.gov

Charlotte TerKeurst cft@cpuc.ca.gov

Christine S. Tam tam@cpuc.ca.gov

Donald R. Smith dsh@cpuc.ca.gov

Ed Moldavsky edm@cpuc.ca.gov

Eugene Cadenasso cpe@cpuc.ca.gov

Harvey Y. Morris hym@cpuc.ca.gov

Henry Stern hs1@cpuc.ca.gov

Jaclyn Marks jm3@cpuc.ca.gov

Jacqueline Greig jnm@cpuc.ca.gov

Jamie Fordyce jbf@cpuc.ca.gov

Jason R. Salmi Klotz jk1@cpuc.ca.gov

Jeorge S. Tagnipes jst@cpuc.ca.gov

Joel T. Perlstein jtp@cpuc.ca.gov

Jonathan Lakritz jol@cpuc.ca.gov

Judith Ikle jci@cpuc.ca.gov

Julie A. Fitch jf2@cpuc.ca.gov

Kristin Ralff Douglas krd@cpuc.ca.gov

Lainie Motamedi Irm@cpuc.ca.gov

Lana Tran ltt@cpuc.ca.gov

Matthew Deal mjd@cpuc.ca.gov

Nancy Ryan ner@cpuc.ca.gov

Pamela Wellner pw1@cpuc.ca.gov

Paul S. Phillips psp@cpuc.ca.gov

Pearlie Sabino pzs@cpuc.ca.gov

Rahmon Momoh rmm@cpuc.ca.gov

Richard A. Myers ram@cpuc.ca.gov

Sara M. Kamins smk@cpuc.ca.gov

Scott Murtishaw sgm@cpuc.ca.gov

Sean A. Simon svn@cpuc.ca.gov

Steve Roscow scr@cpuc.ca.gov

Theresa Cho tcx@cpuc.ca.gov

BILL LOCKYER ken.alex@doj.ca.gov

KEN ALEX ken.alex@doj.ca.gov

BALDASSARO DI CAPO bdicapo@caiso.com

JUDITH B. SANDERS jsanders@caiso.com

JULIE GILL jgill@caiso.com

MARY MCDONALD DIRECTOR OF STATE AFFAIRS CALIFORNIA INDEPENDENT SYSTEM OPERATOR CAISO 151 BLUE RAVINE ROAD FOLSOM, CA 95630

PHILIP D. PETTINGILL ppettingill@caiso.com

MICHAEL SCHEIBLE mscheibl@arb.ca.gov

EVAN POWERS epowers@arb.ca.gov

JEFFREY DOLL jdoll@arb.ca.gov

PAM BURMICH pburmich@arb.ca.gov

B. B. BLEVINS bblevins@energy.state.ca.us

DARYL METZ dmetz@energy.state.ca.us

DEBORAH SLON deborah.slon@doj.ca.gov

Don Schultz dks@cpuc.ca.gov

KAREN GRIFFIN kgriffin@energy.state.ca.us

LISA DECARLO Idecarlo@energy.state.ca.us

MARC PRYOR mpryor@energy.state.ca.us

MICHELLE GARCIA mgarcia@arb.ca.gov

PIERRE H. DUVAIR pduvair@energy.state.ca.us

Wade McCartney wsm@cpuc.ca.gov

CAROL J. HURLOCK hurlock@water.ca.gov

HOLLY B. CRONIN hcronin@water.ca.gov

ROSS A. MILLER rmiller@energy.state.ca.us

PUC/X94763.v1